



**The Children's Hospital,
University of Child Health Sciences,**
Ferozepur Road, Lahore Phone # (92) (42) 99230901-23 Fax # 99231560



No. P.C./ 64133

/CH&ICH

Dated 19-11-2022

To

Mr. Abdul Wahab
I/C Programmer (I.T.)
Health Department, Civil Secretariat,
Lahore.

Subject: - **REQUEST FOR UPLOADING THE MINUTES OF GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE MEETING REGARDING THE PURCHASE OF ELECTROMEDICAL EQUIPMENT / PLANT AND MACHINERY & IT EQUIPMENT ON HEALTH DEPARTMENT WEBSITE FOR THE YEAR 2022-2023**

Please find enclosed herewith Minutes of Grievance Committee Regarding the Purchase of Electro Medical Equipment / Plant and Machinery & IT Equipment under ADP Scheme "Establishment of Paediatric Burn Center" in The Children's Hospital, Lahore for the year 2022-2023, need to be upload in the Health Department website.

Your positive response will be highly appreciated.

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saleem

(FCPS, FACS (USA), MBE-IDE)

Professor of Paediatric Surgery
Medical Director

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 26-10-2022 AT 10:30 A.M. REGARDING THE GRIEVANCE OF THE FIRMS AGAINST THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECISION FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF ELECTRO MEDICAL EQUIPMENT, PLANT & MACHINERY AND IT EQUIPMENT FOR THE YEAR 2022-2023

With reference to letter No. P.C./58845-49/CH&UCHS dated 24-10-2022, a grievance committee meeting was held on 26.10.2022 at 10:30 A.M. in the conference room of the admin block, The Children's Hospital, Lahore regarding addressing the grievance of the firms under bid reference No. 41611/CH&UCHS for the Purchase of Procurement of Electro Medical Equipment, Plant & Machinery and IT Equipment for the year 2022-2023.

The meeting started with the name of Allah, the most beneficent the most merciful.

The committee was briefed about the tender process and the technical evaluation of the firms, bid and representation from different firms regarding the non-responsive status in technical advisory committee report which was uploaded / publically announced on websites

Detail of firm's grievances / TAC status of reason of rejections of firms and decision of committee are as under.

Bid Sr. No.	Name of the Equipment	Aggrieved Firm	Cause of Rejection	Grievance / Clarification received from the firm	Discussion/Justification against Grievance
13.	Central Oxygen Supply System	M/s Advance System	Non-Compliance with quality standards Technical eligibility of the product not accepted	Our quoted product are CE certified and we had attached the CE Certificate of quoted items with our technical bid further again attached for your kind reference. We attached the compliance specification sheet with our technical bid further is attached for your kind reference.	The Product quoted by the firm is not as per standard the said firm quoted few items of chins based as per Bidding document it was not acceptable. <u>Decision</u> of TAC remained Sustained, Hence Grievance Rejected by the Committee
14.	a). Bed Head Unit for medical gases with outlet b). Vacuum Regulator c). Oxygen Flow Meter	M/s Advance System	Non-Compliance with quality standards Technical eligibility of the product not accepted	We are responsive for same items in tender reference No. 41617/6/CH&UCHS for framework contract of Accessories for equipment for the year 2022-23. We already supplied the same items in your institute in last financial year 2021-22 against tender No. 37888/3/CH&UCHS for Accessories for equipment. We meet your advertised specifications of equipment, you are requested to please inform us the reason of rejection of samples. Only one firm is responsive for above said items. You are requested to please reevaluate your decision and make us responsive for healthy competition.	Upon physical inspection the product was not up to the mark. <u>Decision</u> of TAC remained Sustained, Hence Grievance Rejected by the Committee.

MA-89 480

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 26-10-2022 AT 10:30 A.M. REGARDING THE GRIEVANCE OF THE FIRMS AGAINST THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECISION FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF ELECTRO MEDICAL EQUIPMENT, PLANT & MACHINERY AND IT EQUIPMENT FOR THE YEAR 2022-2023

Bid Sr. No.	Name of the Equipment	Aggrieved Firm	Cause of Rejection	Grievance / Clarification received from the firm	Discussion/Justification against Grievance
21.	CBC Analyzer	M/s Gulf Marketing International	No third party CE Certificate attached Technical eligibility of the product not accepted	<p>We M/s Gulf Marketing International quoted CBC Analyzer with Brand Name Mydhic-18, Made by Germany (Certified by College of American pathologist) but rejected without mentioning the reason, while the quoted product fulfilling all the criteria of quality certificates as well as specification as per PVMS list, moreover only one company in the quoted item is approved that is M/s S.Ejaz-Ud-Din for Sysmax. It seems a closed tender for only one company was advertised and the only company for that product is approved which is a biased decision.</p> <p>Respected Sir the quoted items by M/s Gulf Marketing International is approved by many institutes of Pakistan just because of quality, kindly accept the comments and consider the items as accepted. This will help healthy competition. (PO attached in the bid submitted on the day of tender submission).</p> <p>Respected sir the quoted items are quality products and in use of major Institutes of Pakistan, accept the comments and reconsider our quoted products. It will help healthy competition and also save the budget of the institute.</p> <p>Item No. 21 (CBC Analyzer (Hematology Analyzer 3-Part)</p> <p>Poor Services in Teaching Hospitals: In this regards we request you, please check our progress and services in all the teaching hospitals overall in Punjab including your prestigious Institution we are giving our best services to ensure the quality work. If some time small errors comes out during the course of time it doesn't means that we have poor services. Sir as you know we are already working with your institution and giving good services to your concern department and as far as the services are concern, we make sure that we will improve our services for the entire satisfaction of your concerns, if a chance is given to us. Hope this information will find you in a good health & help you to make us responsive because this is very much important for the healthy competition.</p> <p>So it is requested to your honor that please looks into the matter and advice the concern.</p>	<p>Grievance will be addressed after decision of purchase of the Said Equipment "CBC Analyzer".</p>

(Signature)

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 26-10-2022 AT 10:30 A.M. REGARDING THE GRIEVANCE OF THE FIRMS AGAINST THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECISION FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF ELECTRO MEDICAL EQUIPMENT, PLANT & MACHINERY AND IT EQUIPMENT FOR THE YEAR 2022-2023

Bid Sr. No.	Name of the Equipment	Aggrieved Firm	Cause of Rejection	Grievance / Clarification received from the firm	Discussion/Justification against Grievance
22.	Operation Table Electro Hydraulic	M/s G Med (Pvt) Ltd	No third party CE Certificate attached Technical eligibility of the product not accepted	<p>We have already submitted the Declaration of Conformity on the letter head of our manufacturer with our technical offer which confirms that our product Complies with the requirements of the Directive 93/42/EEC (MDD) and it is equivalent to CE certificate (Attached again for your kind consideration) As per COUNCIL DIRECTIVE 93/42/EEC For the Class I devices the manufacturer can declares under his responsibility the conformity of the medical device, can issued a document with which he guarantees that his products meet the provisions of Directive 93/42. The EC declaration of conformity is the simplest procedure and, as a declaration of assumption of responsibility, does not require the intervention of a Notified Body (Directive 93/42/EEC directive relevant page attached).</p> <p>As our quoted product is a class I devices so manufacturer can give the declaration of conformity on its own therefore it is requested that please accept our submitted Declaration of Conformity from Manufacturer. We have been qualified in several tender against same Evaluation criteria and supply of OT table. Evaluation report is attached for your kind Consideration please.</p> <p>It is requested that please evaluate our offer for specification compliance feature wise for product Eligibility.</p>	<p>After reviewing the facts the Committee considering the justification provided by the firm against quality certification in the light of Directive 98/79/ECthe committee accepted the stance of firm and accepted the quality certificatewhereas ,the overall status of the firm remains non responsive due to incomplete package.</p> <p>Decision Grievance of the firm on said point is accepted, but the decision of the TAC remained sustained.</p>

(Signature)

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 26-10-2022 AT 10:30 A.M. REGARDING THE GRIEVANCE OF THE FIRMS AGAINST THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECISION FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF ELECTRO MEDICAL EQUIPMENT. PLANT & MACHINERY AND IT EQUIPMENT FOR THE YEAR 2022-2023

Bid Sr. No.	Name of the Equipment	Aggrieved Firm	Cause of Rejection	Grievance / Clarification received from the firm	Discussion/Justification against Grievance
24	Operation Theater light	M/s G Med (Pvt) Ltd	No third party CE Certificate attached Technical eligibility of the product not accepted	<p>We have already submitted the Declaration of Conformity on the letter head of our manufacturer with our technical offer which confirms that our product Complies with the requirements of the Directive 93/42/EEC (MDD) and it is equivalent to CE certificate.(Attached again for your kind consideration) As per COUNCIL DIRECTIVE 93/42/EEC For the Class I devices the manufacturer can declares under his responsibility the conformity of the medical device, can issued a document with which he guarantees that his products meet the provisions of Directive 93/42. The EC declaration of conformity is the simplest procedure and, as a declaration of assumption of responsibility, does not require the intervention of a Notified Body (Directive 93/42/EEC directive relevant page attached).</p> <p>As our quoted product is a class I devices so manufacturer can give the declaration of conformity on its own therefore it is requested that please accept our submitted Declaration of conformity from Manufacturer. We have been qualified in several tender against same evaluation criteria and supply of OT light. Evaluation report is attached for your kind consideration please.</p>	<p>After reviewing the facts the Committee considering the justification provided by the firm against quality certification in the light of Directive 98/79/EC the committee accepted the stance of firm and accepted the quality certificate whereas ,the overall status of the firm remains non responsive due to incomplete package.</p> <p>Decision Grievance of the firm on said point is accepted, but the decision of the TAC remained sustained.</p>

(Handwritten signatures)

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 26-10-2022 AT 10:30 A.M. REGARDING THE GRIEVANCE OF THE FIRMS AGAINST THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECISION FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF ELECTRO MEDICAL EQUIPMENT, PLANT & MACHINERY AND IT EQUIPMENT FOR THE YEAR 2022-2023

Bid Sr. No.	Name of the Equipment	Aggrieved Firm	Cause of Rejection	Grievance / Clarification received from the firm	Discussion/Justification against Grievance
28.	Meshes skin graft	M/s Medic Ally (Pvt) Ltd.	Bidder past performance for quoted product in teaching hospital not attached Demo not presented Technical eligibility of the product not accepted Technical eligibility of the firm not accepted	We, Medic Ally Private Limited, would like to request to demonstrate the Meshes Skin Graft to the honorable End-user (his excellence) & honorable Technical Scrutiny Committee to verify the integrity & technical eligibility of the Product being C.E. Marked with Netherlands as both the Country of Manufacturing & Origin & installed globally at leading Burn Centers. In the wake of the above it is very humbly requested to consider our request for demonstration to examine the robust quality & user friendly nature of the Skin Graft Meshes installed at Key Burn Centers globally & trusted by Global Key Opinion Leaders. We, Medic Ally Private Limited do hereby undertake to provide quality & unrestrained services against the Item if approved technically.	Failed to convenience the committee and any authentic documents. <u>Decision</u> of TAC remained Sustained, Hence Grievance Rejected by the Committee

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 26-10-2022 AT 10:30 A.M. REGARDING THE GRIEVANCE OF THE FIRMS AGAINST THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECISION FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF ELECTRO MEDICAL EQUIPMENT, PLANT & MACHINERY AND IT EQUIPMENT FOR THE YEAR 2022-2023

Bid Sr. No.	Name of the Equipment	Aggrieved Firm	Cause of Rejection	Grievance / Clarification received from the firm	Discussion/Justification against Grievance
33.	a). Hand Surgery Sets for burn hand (Local) b). General Plastic & Burn Surgery Sets (Local) c). Dressing sets	M/s Aswad Instruments	Bidder past performance for quoted product in teaching hospital not attached Demo not presented Technical eligibility of the product not accepted Technical eligibility of the firm not accepted	This is to inform you that we have participated in tender serial no. 33 (a. Hand Surgery Sets for burn hand, b. General plastic & burn surgery set, c. Dressing sets LOCAL made). Our offer declared as non-responsive due to rejection of demonstration and no past performance. We would like to bring in your kind notice that we have already been exporting our instruments to following countries since last 12 years i.e. Australia, Germany, Singapore, Romania, Hungary, Poland, Switzerland, United Kingdom, Canada, Colombia, Nepal, UAE, Saudi Arabia, New Zealand, South Korea, Bahrain, Libya, Greece & Italy. Also we have supplied our instruments in Federal Govt. Polyclinic Hospital Islamabad, Shifa International Hospital Islamabad, Gujranwala Medical College Gujranwala. We also would like to mention here that the single responsive bidder M/s Surgiquips was our competitor in a tender floated by Gujranwala Medical College was due on. 07.03.2022. The tender was required for five different departments (Neuro Surgery, Vascular Surgery, ENT, Ortho & General Surgery). M/s Strugiquips was technical rejected on Demo. Their instruments were rejected by five departments as mentioned above. This tender was awarded to us, also verifiable from the Institute. Apart from this M/s Surgiquips was technical rejected in BV Hospital Bahawalpur, Primary & Secondary Healthcare department for ADP Scheme Dera Ghazi Khan (evaluation reports enclosed) We have also submitted you a letter on 15.09.2022 mentioning the material grades of the quoted instruments (copy enclosed). In the light of above we would request honorable technical committee to review the case and grade our offer technically accepted following the tradition of a healthy competition.	The quality of the equipment presented in the demonstration was not upto the mark. Decision: Decision of TAC remained Sustained, Hence Grievance Rejected by the Committee.

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 26-10-2022 AT 10:30 A.M. REGARDING THE GRIEVANCE OF THE FIRMS AGAINST THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECISION FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF ELECTRO MEDICAL EQUIPMENT, PLANT & MACHINERY AND IT EQUIPMENT FOR THE YEAR 2022-2023

Bid Sr. No.	Name of the Equipment	Aggrieved Firm	Cause of Rejection	Grievance / Clarification received from the firm	Discussion/Justification against Grievance
42.	Operating Microscope	M/s Jasani Scientifics	Bid security CDR / Bank Guarantee @ 2% of estimated cost not attached in original with the technical bid only copy attached with hidden values	Kindly note that we have quoted Sr. No. 42 Operating Microscope of world's renowned brand Leica Mikrosysteme of Germany that fulfil your advertised specs and also better in some features i.e. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • APO-chromatic 5-step-changer, motorized - 6.4x, 10x, 16x, 25x, 40x Magnification changer • 4K video camera with built in recorder We have submitted a copy of the CDR No. 1104002023 dated 17-08-2022 for Rs. 139,000.00 towards bid security with our technical quotation and original is attached with the financial quotation.	Knockdown clause as per advertisement the CDR is part of Technical offer. Decision Decision of TAC remained Sustained, Hence Grievance Rejected by the Committee.
44.	Shortwave Diathermy	M/s Medic Ally (Pvt) Ltd.	Bidder past performance for quoted product in teaching hospital not attached	We, Medic Ally Private Limited would like to submit the Satisfactory Past Performance report of the quoted Product (Model: Ultratherm 1008 & Make: GBO Medizintechnik AG, Germany) in Teaching Hospital: installed at Department of Physical Medicine & Rehabilitation. In the wake of the above it is very humbly requested that our technical bid may kindly be accepted being fully compliant with the requirement of the Institution. 1) That the Reliance Medical Pvt has not attached the bidder past performance certificate in teaching hospital. We have attached the bidder Past Performance certificate with the bidding documents. For your consideration we request your kind self to please see the attached certificates and accept our grievances.	Failed to convenience the committee and any authentic documents. Decision Decision of TAC remained Sustained, Hence Grievance Rejected by the Committee Satisfactory past performance certificate were present by the firm to grievance committee of teaching institute. Decision Decision of TAC is Overruled and grievance accepted, Hence declared Responsive.

(Signature) *(Signature)*

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 26-10-2022 AT 10:30 A.M. REGARDING THE GRIEVANCE OF THE FIRMS AGAINST THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE DECISION FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF ELECTRO MEDICAL EQUIPMENT, PLANT & MACHINERY AND IT EQUIPMENT FOR THE YEAR 2022-2023

Bid Sr. No.	Name of the Equipment	Aggrieved Firm	Cause of Rejection	Grievance / Clarification received from the firm	Discussion/Justification against Grievance
45.	Ultrasound unit	M/s Reliance Medical (Pvt) Ltd.	Bidder past performance for quoted product in teaching hospital not attached Warranty conditional	1) That the Reliance Medical Pvt has not attached the bidder past performance certificate in teaching hospital. We have attached the bidder Past Performance certificate with the bidding documents. For your consideration we request your kind self to please see the attached certificates and accept our grievances.	Satisfactory past performance certificate were present by the firm to grievance committee of teaching institute. Decision Decision of TAC is Overruled and grievance accepted, Hence declared Responsive.

Abdul Jalil
Biomedical Engineer
Jinnah Hospital, Lahore

Dr. Edrees Awwar Sheikh
AMS (Admin)

Dr. Muhammad Asim Khan
Prof. of Pead Cardiovascular Surgery

Dr. Samina Zaman
Prof. of Histiopathology

Dr. Farhana Muzaffar
Prof. of Peads. Dermatology

Medical Director

It is submitted for information & approval please